Committee meeting at the office of
McKim, Mead & White, 101 Park Avenue, New York City,
at 10 a. m., November 15, 1918.

A committee meeting of Mr. Kendall, Mr. Greenleaf, Mr. Adams, and Mr. Weir was held at the office of McKim, Mead & White, 101 Park Avenue, New York City (Mr. Kendall's office) at 10 o'clock on the morning of November 16, 1918. Mr. Moore, the chairman, (ex officio) and Colonel Ridley, the Secretary and Executive Officer of the Commission, also attended.

EXTENSION TO HYGIENIC LABORATORY: The meeting was called primarily to pass on the design for a new extension to the Hygienic Laboratory building of the Public Health Service in Washington, which had been submitted for comment and advice by the Treasury Department. The arrangement proposed, the Treasury Department stated, while meeting the present needs, was such that the new building will lend itself to the future general scheme of enlargement of this group, as was indicated on a sketch submitted. The scheme also appeared in conformity with the general recommendations of the Public Buildings Commission's report affecting this particular Bureau and its location. The design was considered pleasing, and approval was recommended.

DESIGN FOR NEW PENNSYLVANIA RAILROAD BRIDGE OVER THE ANACOSTIA RIVER: The local United States Engineer Office had submitted elevations showing alternative designs for a new railroad bridge proposed to be erected by the Pennsylvania railroad to take the place of the present structure spanning the Anacostia River between Bennings Bridge and the Pennsylvania Avenue Bridge. The consideration of a design and grades for this bridge brought up many related problems of design and grade of possible future structures in that region. For instance, it was considered necessary now to decide whether Massachusetts Avenue should be continued across the Anacostia or should terminate on the western bank, and, if it is to go through, the type and height of the bridge on the Massachusetts Avenue axis, whether the roadways of the Anacostia Water Park should go above or underneath the railroad bridge, &c. These matters were discussed at some length, but held over for decision at the next meeting, which was to take place on November 22d.

Upon inquiry from Mr. John Aspegren, Chairman of the John Ericsson lay memorial commission, the members gladly acceded to his request for a short informal conference with him, Dr. Leach, and Mr. Bergquist of their commission regarding certain features connected with the securing of a design for the Ericsson Memorial to be erected in Washington. No official action was taken.

APPROVED:_____ Colonel, U. S. Army,

Chairman. Secretary & Executive Officer.

Minutes of the meeting of the
Commission of Fine Arts held on Friday,
November 22, 1918.

The third meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts during the fiscal year 1919 was held in its office at 1729 New York avenue, NW., Washington, D. C., on Friday, November 22, 1918.

The following members were present:

Mr. Moore, the Chairman;

Mr. Adams;

Mr. Weir;

Mr. Kendall;

Mr. Pope;

Mr. Greenleaf;

also Colonel C. S. Ridley, U. S. Army, Secretary and Executive Officer of the Commission.

The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a. m., and immediately proceeded to the business before it.

1. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE PRECEDING MEETING: The minutes of the preceding meeting held on October 4, 1918, were presented by the Secretary and approved.

2. LETTER FROM MUNICIPAL ARCHITECT: Colonel Ridley read to the Commission a letter from Mr. Snowden Ashford, the Municipal Architect for the District of Columbia, dated October 7th last, in which he stated that, according to the Commission's advice at the time, certain changes recommended by the Commission had been made by him in the designs for the proposed Municipal Lodging House on Louisiana Avenue and a police station on Rhode Island Avenue, NE., and that the proposed water tower on the Municipal Fish Market on the water-front had been eliminated, a centrifugal pump to be installed instead. The Commission were pleased to learn of these results, particularly regarding the elimination of the water-tower on the fish market.

3. REMOVAL OF THE LINCOLN STATUE FROM IN FRONT OF THE OLD CITY HALL: Colonel Ridley

stated that he had been approached by the McCoy Chief Justice of the District Supreme Court regarding the possibility of the removal of the present Lincoln monument in front of the Court-House (old City Hall). The Chief Justice considers it "a frightful object to have in front of the building" and would like to have it removed. The Commission were glad to learn that a sincere effort was being made to remove the monument, and recalled that at a preceding meeting (May 5, 1918) when the question of a possible lowering in height of the whole monument composition was discussed that they had recommended that the statue and pedestal be either left as it is or be taken away altogether. Discussing the possibilities of a relocation of the entire composition, the members felt there was no other site within the District of Columbia to which they could recommend its removal. It was suggested to Colonel Ridley, however, that there may be some inner court or niche in the walls of the corridors to which the statue itself might be removed.

4. CHANGE IN MATERIAL TO BE USED FOR PEDESTAL OF KEY MEMORIAL: Colonel Ridley stated that all the stone work for the pedestal and base of the Key memorial which had been cut for erection at Fort McHenry, Baltimore, Maryland, had been rejected, and that Mr. Niehaus, the sculptor, desired to change the stone for this work from Pink Tennessee marble to Balfour Rose-pink granite, and asked whether there was any artistic objection to such a change. The Commission advised that there was no such objection.

5. PENNSYLVANIA RAILROAD BRIDGE DESIGNS: Colonel Ridley brought up for consideration the two designs for a Pennsylvania railroad bridge submitted by the local United States Engineer Office for the approval or comments of the Commission. The designs had been discussed at the committee meeting in New York City on the sixteenth of November, when the committee members acquainted themselves with all the incidental details of grade and future park development in the neighborhood.

It appears that a recent order from the Secretary of War directed the Pennsylvania Railroad Company to modify the draw in their present freight bridge across the Anacostia River. This order stipulated that a movable span should be provided, centrally located, which would give a clear opening of not less than 75 feet wide measured at

right angles to the stream, or, if a fixed bridge be preferred, so as to provide a clear opening similarly measured of not less than 150 feet wide and a clear headroom of not less than 50 feet at mean low water. The alternative plans submitted and under consideration were said to meet, in part, both of the above requirements as they provided a movable span 75 feet wide but with a fixed vertical clearance with draw raised of 50 feet. The local United States Engineer Office considered this satisfactory. The Pennsylvania Railroad Company had stated that they had been making studies of the situation, and on account of the skew, the vertical lift bridge, similar to the small one at present in operation at this point, seemed to them advisable both from an operating and economical point of view. The two designs practically differed only in the type of drawspan, one of them having the hoist attachment on the lower chord, and the other on the upper chord; this influenced the height of the towers. The Railroad Company preferred the design having the hoist attachment on the upper chord since, although more expensive, it promised more satisfactory operation, the center of gravity of the span being below the point of the hoist attachment.

The United States Engineer Office had called the attention of the Railroad Company to the fact that in the near future the Pennsylvania Avenue Highway bridge will have to be rebuilt, and probably on a higher grade; designs for such changes were already being initiated in their office. These changes, it was pointed out, would enable the railroad company to raise the track grade under this bridge. It was also pointed out that the plans for the improvement of the Anacostia Water Park contemplated under crossings of the railroad embankment or under the shore spans of the bridge for the park roadways which would parallel the present seawalls. In the general design and treatment of the channel span of the contemplated bridge, as well as the remainder of the bridge, the fact should be kept in mind (the railroad was reminded) that the structure will be located in the midst of a beautiful land and water park and that a reasonable harmony should be secured, and that particularly with the channel span a symmetry of outline was desired.

The designs, as submitted, showed the grade of the track about 12 feet above mean

low water, which is practically the grade of the present track. In the memorandum submitted by the Engineer Office it was pointed out that a raise in grade from the 12' to 24' would serve several purposes: the higher grade would provide for the necessary park roadway undercrossings; the existing deep pocket of the present track grade would be reduced; and the number of draw openings would be reduced to the benefit of both navigation and railroad traffic.

The Commission considered the railroad bridge problem in connection with the development of the Anacostia Water Park and the possibilities of the extension of Massachusetts Avenue on a high grade bridge form the western bank of the Anacostia River to the eastern bank. The members voiced their disappointment in both designs for the railroad bridge submitted, and first of all advised doing away with the towers. It was thought that a swing bridge instead of a bascule bridge would be far better; a swing bridge would give them the 75' width desired. They also preferred a deck bridge, it being suggested that the elevated structure be of concrete arch on iron, similar to designs used elsewhere. The swing bridge would probably be of iron, and preferably solid plate girder work instead of open work girders. The idea is to keep things level. The suggested 24' grade for the railroad bridge was approved, keeping in mind the statement of the Engineer Office that new designs for the Pennsylvania Railroad Bridge under consideration will very likely raise the grade of that bridge and permit raising the railroad grade, the present clearance under the Pennsylvania Avenue bridge, a limiting point for the railroad grades, being controlled by the grade of that bridge.

In the study of the relation of Massachusetts Avenue, Anacostia Water Park, and the railroad bridge with reference to each other, it was decided that Massachusetts Avenue should be carried across the Anacostia River at the highest level possible (one reason being to avoid a draw), and that the park roadways are to go underneath the railroad tracks, grade crossings being impossible.

Mr. Smith, engineer in the office of the local United States Engineer Office, appeared at the request of the Commission for a discussion of details arising in connec-

tion with the study of these various problems, and went over the situation as discussed above with the members at some length.

6. LAYOUT FOR MUNICIPAL HOSPITAL ON RESERVATION 13: On July 27, 1915, the Board of Commissioners of the District of Columbia submitted to the Commission preliminary plans showing the general layout for the entire group and designs of individual buildings of the proposed new Municipal Hospital then proposed for erection on the Fourteent and Upshur streets site. The Commission approved the type of architecture adopted and the general layout for that site, subject to further consultation when the designs had been more fully developed. By Act of Congress approved March 3, 1917, however, the site for this group was changed to Reservation 13 in the District, and restudies, it was learned, had been in progress looking to a realignment of the proposed structures to the changed conditions of the new site. It had been learned only recently that the layout for the new site had been approved by the Board of Commissioners of the District without again consulting the Commission of Fine Arts, and, since it was considered of the highest importance to the appearance of the city that the entire composition shall present an orderly appearance from both Massachusetts Avenue and the proposed Anacostia Water Park and that the development of the Anacostia Water Park with its roadways and bridges should be considered in connection with the hospital layout, a resubmission of the layout for the hospital group as proposed had been requested by the Chairman. The three plans sent up by the District Commissioners showed, first, the scheme approved by the District Commissioners and the Board of Charity with the hospital buildings strung along at right angles to Massachusetts Avenue but not on a north and sough axis, - secondly, a scheme (not approved) showing the individual buildings strung along Massachusetts Avenue but oblique to the Avenue with the buildings on a north and south axis, - and, thirdly, a composition (also not approved) showing the buildings grouped on a north and south axis but in a triangular-shaped manner on the western end of the reservation. The situation was discussed at great length, the Commission not being pleased with any of the schemes shown. The scheme approved by the District Commissioners and the Board of Charities was considered im-

practicable and impossible. No final action was taken, the whole question resolving itself at this time, in the opinion of the members, to a matter of personal conferences with the Commissioners and the Board of Charities officials.

7. MEADE MEMORIAL: The Commission had been informed that a sketch model showing the Meade Memorial had been prepared by the sculptor (Mr. Charles Grafly) and the architects (Messrs. Simon and Bassett) in which the architecture of pedestal and base had been revised to meet the criticisms of the members of the Commission during the inspection of the last submitted model. Mr. Adams, Mr. Weir, Mr. Kendall, Mr. Pope, and Mr. Greenleaf were therefore appointed a committee with power to inspect this model at the studio of the sculptor in Philadelphia, and Mr. Cammerer was instructed to accompany them. This inspection took place at 3 o'clock Saturday afternoon, November 23d, both sculptor and architect being present. A delegation from the Meade Memorial Commission of the State of Pennsylvania also were present upon the arrival of the committee, but withdrew shortly after the committee's arrival. The members were pleased with the results achieved in the study of the architectural features of the composition, and approved the composition as submitted, namely, a sculptural group without flags, and the pedestal. The sculptor and architect were congratulated upon the improvement in the design.

Lunch was served at 1 o'clock, the members of the Commission having as their personal guests The Right Honorable Lord Charnwood, Hon. Wm. H. Taft, Hon. Henry White, The Secretary of the British Embassy, Mr. Chilton, Mr. Cass Gilbert, Mr. Frederick Law Olmsted, Mr. Henry Bacon, Lt. Col. Chas. W. Richardson, and the Surgeon General of the Army. After lunch they accompanied Lord Charnwood for an inspection of the Lincoln Memorial.

There being no further business to come before the meeting, the Commission adjourned at 2:30 p. m., subject to the call of the Chairman.

APPROVED:_____ Colonel, U. S. Army,

Secretary & Executive Officer.